## **Ethical and Legal Issues in Public Health**

#### **PHP 2080**

Syllabus (9/6/11; will be updated)

Thursday 9:00 – 11:30am Room 259, 121 South Main Street

Instructor: Linda Laliberte, JD, MS

Office: Room 218, 121 South Main St.

Telephone: 863-3819
Office Hours: By appointment

Textbooks: May not be in bookstore, but they are available on Amazon.

Dan E. Beauchamp, Bonnie Steinbock (eds):

New Ethics for the Public's Health, New York: Oxford Press, 1999

Lawrence O. Gostin, ed.

Public Health Law and Ethics: a Reader, University of California Press, 2002

(second edition 2010 available, but OK to use 2002 edition, which is on reserve at Sci Li)

Lawrence O Gostin, ed.

Public Health Law: Power, Duty, Restraint, University of California Press, 2008

On Reserve at Sci Li

## **Learning Objectives:**

At the conclusion of the course, students will be able to:

- 1. Identify key ethical principles and values relevant to public health practice and research
- 2. Understand legal and regulatory issues related to public health
- 3. Evaluate public health research designs in terms of ethical, legal principles, including appropriate informed consent
- 4. Conduct an ethical analysis of public health interventions, identifying potential ethical concerns and conflicts and balancing burdens and benefits across populations
- 5. Employ strategies for working effectively with special populations, including different racial, ethnic or cultural groups, or those who are vulnerable because of institutional, health or social status
- 6. Apply public health values, principles and regulation in "real life" case studies

#### **Evaluation and Deliverables:**

- 1. Class participation and preparation
- 2. Performance on case studies and exercises
- 3. Final term product: Applied Ethics Project (10-15 page paper and 10 minute class presentation)
- 4. Written evaluation of each class presentation.

| Class<br>Date            | Topic   |                     |
|--------------------------|---|---------------------|
| 9/8  1st Class           | Introduction, Course Overview, Historical Perspective Introductions of Faculty and Class, Interest/Experiences Class Logistics, Review Syllabus Definition of Public Health Case Study Approach to Learning |                     |
|                          | Readings: Beauchamp and Steinbock: Pages 3-23 Gostin, 2002 Pages 1-65   |                     |
|                          | Kreber C. Learning Experientially through Case Studies? A Conceptual Analysis. <i>Teaching in Higher Education</i> , 6(2):217-228. 2001.  |                     |
|                          | Callahan D and Jennings B. Ethics and Public Health: Forging a Strong Relationship. <i>AJPH</i> 92(2): 169 – 176. February 2002.  |                     |
|                          | Childress, James F. Et al., Public Health Ethics: Mapping the Terrain, Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics, 30 (2002): 170-178.   |                     |
|                          | Roberts MJ, Reich MR. Ethical analysis in Public Health. Lancet (2002) 359:1055-1059  |                     |
|                          | Kass N. An Ethics Framework for Public Health. <i>AJPH</i> . 91(11): 1776-1782. November 2001.  |                     |
|                          | Gostin, LO and Powers, M. What Does Social Justice Require for the Public's Health? Public Health Ethics and Policy Imperatives. Health Affairs 25(4): 1053-1060 (2006).                                    |                     |
|                          | Of interest:  |                     |
|                          | Institute of Medicine, For the Public's Health: Revitalizing Law and Policy to Meet New Challenges, Report Brief, June, 2011.   |                     |
| 9/15                     | Philosophical Perspectives, Models of Ethical Decision Making, Key Legal Concepts   | Guest:<br>Fox Wetle |
| 2 <sup>nd</sup><br>Class | Ethical concepts in public health, medicine and society Strategies for Decision Making and Resolving Conflicts  |                     |
|                          | Key concepts of US law in Public Health Federal and state government powers and limits on these powers Introduction to Privacy Case for next class  |                     |
|                          | Readings: Beauchamp and Steinbock: Pages 53-93 Gostin, 2002: Chapters 3, 5 and 6  |                     |

Lamm, Richard D. Redrawing the Ethics Map, Hastings Center Report 29, no. 2 (1999): 28-29.

Bloche, MG. "Clinical Loyalties and the Social Purposes of Medicine." <u>JAMA.</u> 281(3). 268-274. January 1999.

Tong, R. "Feminist Approaches to Bioethics." Lahey Clinic Medical Ethics Newsletter. 1-2. Winter 1999 http://www.lahey.org/pdf/ethics/winter\_1999.pdf

Bayer R and Fairchild A. The Genesis of Public Health Ethics. Bioethics. 18(6). 473-492. November 2004.

Upshur R. Principles for the Justification of Public Health Intervention. Canadian Journal of Public Health. 93(2): 101-103. March-April 2002.

Guest:

Robert

Marshall

# 9/22 Informed Consent, Privacy, Confidentiality, Uses of Information and Non-voluntary Disclosure

3<sup>rd</sup> Class

History and principles of Informed Consent

HIPAA: health information privacy and confidentiality

Case: Protecting Health Information Privacy

Introduction to Case for next class

# **Readings:**

Gostin, 2002 Chapter 10 (Pages 295-333)

Gostin, 2008 (Reserve) Pages 287-330

AGS Ethics and Research Committee, The Responsible Conduct of Research, Journal of the American Geriatrics Society, 49:1120-1122, 2001

Truog, RD et al. "Is Informed Consent Always Necessary for Randomized, Controlled Trials?" NEJM. 240 (10). 804-807. March 1999

O'Neil O. Informed Consent and Public Health. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. Lond.* B (2004) 359, 1133–1136.

Hiatt R. HIPAA: The End of Epidemiology, or a New Social Contract? *Epidemiology* 14(6): 637-639. November 2003.

Verity C and Nicoll A. Consent, Confidentiality, and the threat to public health surveillance. *BMJ*. 324: 1210-1213. May 2002.

Myers et al. Privacy and Public Health at Risk: Public Health Confidentiality in the Digital Age. *AJPH*. 98(5): 793-801. May 2008.

McGraw, D et al. Privacy as an enabler, not an impediment: Building Trust into Health Information Exchange, *Health Affairs* 28(2): 416-427 (2009).

3

| 9/29            | Public Health Regulation: Balancing the Common Good and Individual Freedoms   |           |
|-----------------|---|-----------|
| 4 <sup>th</sup> | Public Health Administrative Law  |           |
| Class           | Protection of Individual Rights   |           |
|                 | Enabling Legislation  |           |
|                 | Delegated Authority   |           |
|                 | Rulemaking process  |           |
|                 | Regulation and Enforcement  |           |
|                 | Challenges to administrative actions  Case: Regulation of Nursing Homes   |           |
|                 | Case. Regulation of Ivarsing Homes  |           |
|                 | Readings  |           |
|                 | Gostin 2002 Chapter 7 (pp. 203-226)   |           |
|                 | Gostin 2008 Pages 147-178   |           |
|                 |   |           |
|                 | RI General Laws Title 23, Health and Safety (link below) Rules and Regulations for Licensing of Nursing Facilities (R23-17-NF) (link below) |           |
|                 | Rules and Regulations for Electising of Nursing Pacifities (R23-17-NP) (link below)   |           |
|                 | http://www.rilin.state.ri.us/Statutes/TITLE23/INDEX.HTM   |           |
|                 | http://www2.sec.state.ri.us/dar/regdocs/released/pdf/DOH/4215.pdf   |           |
|                 |   |           |
| 10/6            | Vulnerable Populations/Institutional Settings   | Guest:    |
| 5 <sup>th</sup> | Underserved/ Institutionalized: Mentally III, Nursing Homes, Prisons  | Fox Wetle |
| Class           | Legal Concepts Pertaining to Institutionalized Populations Introduction to case for next class  |           |
| Class           | introduction to ease for next class   |           |
|                 | Readings:   |           |
|                 | Gostin, 2002: Pages 82-93, Chapter 4, Pages 312-320, Chapter 13   |           |
|                 |   |           |
|                 | Moye J, Butz SW, Marson DC, Wood E, and the ABA-APA Capacity Assessment of Older  |           |
|                 | Adults Working Group. The Gerontologist. 47(5): 591-603 (2007).   |           |
|                 | Moye J, Wood, S, Edelstein B, Armesto J, Bower EH, Harrison JA, Wood E. Clinical  |           |
|                 | Evidence in Guardianship of Older Adults Is Inadequate: Findings From a Tri-State Study.  |           |
|                 | The Gerontologist. 47(5): 604-612 (2007).   |           |
|                 |   |           |
|                 | Shortell, SM et al. "Physicians as Double Agents: Maintaining Trust in an Era of Multiple   |           |
|                 | Accountabilities." JAMA. 280 (12): 1102-1108 Sept 1998.   |           |
|                 | The Ethics of Research Involving Indigenous Peoples.  |           |
|                 | http://www.iphrc.ca/Upload/ethics_review_iphrc.pdf. Pgs 7-33.   |           |
|                 |   |           |
|                 | Johnstone M. Stigma, social justice and the rights of the mentally ill: Challenging the status  |           |
|                 | quo. Australian and New Zealand Journal of Mental Health Nursing 10, 200-209. 2001.   |           |
|                 | W 0 W 1D 11 V D11 D 11 D 12 D 13 D 14 D 15 D 16 D 17  |           |
|                 | MacQueen K and Buehler J. Ethics, Practice, and Research in Public Health. <i>AJPH</i> . 94(6):   |           |
|                 | 928-931. June 2004.   |           |
|                 |   |           |

|                 | Immigrants Facing Deportation by US Hospitals. New York Times. Aug 3. 2008.   |          |
|-----------------|---|----------|
|                 | Gostin, LO. Biomedical Research Involving Prisoners: Ethical Values and legal regulation, JAMA 297(7): 737-740 (2007).  |          |
|                 | Swanson, J. et al. Racial Disparities in Involuntary Outpatient commitment: Are they real? Health Affairs 28(3): 816-826 (2009).  |          |
| 10/13           | Working in Culturally Diverse Populations   | Guest:   |
| 10/13           | Assumptions, Cultural Fairness  | Patricia |
| 6 <sup>th</sup> | Avoiding Exploitation, Stigmatization   | Risica   |
| Class           | Community Consent   |          |
|                 | Case: Targeting Community Interventions – Sister Talk Introduction to case for next class   |          |
|                 | Readings:   |          |
|                 | Beauchamp & Steinbock Pages 39-44, 95-128   |          |
|                 | Gostin, 2002 Chapter 11   |          |
|                 | K.M. MacQueen, E. McLellan, D.S. Metzger, S. Kegeles, R.P. Strauss, L. Blanchard, R. Scotti, R.T. Trotter. What is Community? An evidence-based definition for participatory public health. American Journal of Public Health 2000; 91 (12): 1929-1938. |          |
|                 | Principles of Community Engagement. Atlanta, GA. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Public Health Program Practice Office. 1997.   |          |
|                 | Betancourt J et al. Cultural Competence And Health Care Disparities: Key Perspectives And Trends. <i>Health Affairs</i> . 24(2): 499-505. 2005.   |          |
|                 | Racher F. The Evolution of Ethics for Community Practice. <i>Journal of Community Health Nursing</i> , 2007, 24(1), 65–76.  |          |
|                 | Have, M.t, deBeaufort, ID et al. "Ethics and prevention of overweight and obesity: an inventory." Obesity Reviews 12:669-679 (2011)   |          |
| 10/20           | International Public Health   | Guest:   |
|                 | Data Collection, Ownership and Uses of Data   | Stephen  |
| 7 <sup>th</sup> | Cultural Sensitivity, Community Standards and Values  | McGarvey |
| Class           | Case: Intervention Trial – AIDS   |          |
|                 | Readings:   |          |
|                 | Beauchamp and Steinbock: Chapter 6 (pp 207-250)   |          |
|                 | Gostin 2008: Chapter 7 (pp 229-283)   |          |
|                 | December 1977 Secretary 2 Debits Health Language CD 1   |          |
|                 | Bassett, MT. "Ensuring a Public Health Impact of Programs to Reduce<br>HIV Transmission From Mothers to Infants: The Place of Voluntary   |          |
|                 | Counseling and Testing." AJPH. 92 (3). 347-351. March 2002  |          |
|                 | Shapiro, HT, Meslin, EM. "Ethical Issues in the Design and Conduct of   |          |

|                          | Clinical Trials in Developing Countries." NEJM. 345:139-142. 2001.  |                   |
|--------------------------|---|-------------------|
|                          | Achrekar, A., Gupta, R. "Informed Consent for a Clinical Trial in Thailand." NEJM. 339 (18):1331-1332. 1998   |                   |
|                          | Correspondence. "Ethics of Placebo-Controlled Trials of Zidovudine to Prevent the Perinatal Transmission of HIV in the Third World." NEJM. 338 (12). 836-841, 1998.                                 |                   |
|                          | Varmus, H., C. Satcher. "Ethical Complexities of Conducting Research in Developing Countries." NEJM. 337(14) 1003-1005. Oct 2, 1997.  |                   |
|                          | Lurie, P., SM Wolfe. "Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce<br>Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing<br>Countries." NEJM. 337(12). 853-856. Sep. 18, 1997. |                   |
|                          | Angell, M. "The Ethics of Clinical Research in the Third World." NEJM. 337(12) 847-849. Sep. 18, 1997   |                   |
| 10/27                    | Tort Litigation for the Public's Health   | Guest:            |
| 8 <sup>th</sup><br>Class | Readings:   | Patrick<br>Vivier |
| Class                    | Gostin, 2002 Chapter 9 Gostin 2008 Chapter 6, Pages 470-473   |                   |
|                          | Tort of Nuisance <a href="http://www.nuisancelaw.com/learn/tort">http://www.nuisancelaw.com/learn/tort</a>  |                   |
|                          | Jacobson P and Warner K. Litigation and Public Health Policy Making: The Case of Tobacco Control. <i>Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law</i> , Vol. 24, No. 4, pp. 769-804, August 1999.     |                   |
|                          | Parmet W and Daynard R. The New Public Health Litigation. <i>Annu. Rev. Public Health</i> . 21:437–54. 2000.  |                   |
|                          | Rabin, R. The Rhode Island Lead Paint Lawsuit: Where do we go from here? <i>New Solutions</i> , Vol. 16(4): 353-363 (2006).   |                   |
|                          | RI Supreme Court Opinion, State of RI v. Lead Industries Association, Inc. et al.(7/1/08).  |                   |
| 11/3                     | Professional Regulation and Disciplinary Codes of Conduct   | Guest:            |
| - th                     | Institutional Rules   | Robert            |
| 9 <sup>th</sup><br>Class | Professional Codes  | Crausman          |
|                          | Professional Codes of Ethics: APHA  |                   |
|                          | http://www.apha.org/programs/education/progeduethicalguidelines.htm   |                   |
|                          |   |                   |

|                           | American Medical Association Code of Ethics: <a href="http://www.ama-assn.org/ama/pub/physician-resources/medical-ethics.shtml">http://www.ama-assn.org/ama/pub/physician-resources/medical-ethics.shtml</a>  |                   |
|---------------------------|---|-------------------|
|                           | American Nurses Association: <a href="http://www.nursingworld.org/MainMenuCategories/EthicsStandards/CodeofEthicsforNurses">http://www.nursingworld.org/MainMenuCategories/EthicsStandards/CodeofEthicsforNurses</a> <a href="mailto:aspx">aspx</a> |                   |
|                           | American Psychological Association: <a href="http://www.apa.org/ethics/code2002.html">http://www.apa.org/ethics/code2002.html</a>   |                   |
|                           | National Association of Social Workers: <a href="http://www.socialworkers.org/pubs/code/code.asp">http://www.socialworkers.org/pubs/code/code.asp</a>   |                   |
|                           | World Health Organization: <a href="http://www.who.int/ethics/en/">http://www.who.int/ethics/en/</a>  |                   |
|                           | Crausman, Robert. Public Health Briefings on RI Board of Medical Licensure and Discipline cases.  |                   |
| 11/10                     | Public Health Genetics: Screening Programs and Individual Testing/Counseling  |                   |
| 10 <sup>th</sup><br>Class | Readings: Beauchamp and Steinbock: Pages 339-377 Gostin 2002: Pages 472-485   |                   |
|                           | Thomas, JC, Irwin, DE, Zulker, ES and Millikan, RC. "Genomics and the Public Health Code of Ethics." AJPH 95: 2139-2143. December 2005.   |                   |
| 11/17                     | Ethical Issues in Health Organizations and Reform   | Guest:            |
| 11 <sup>th</sup> Class    | Organizational Ethics: Structure, decision-making, transparency and Trust Ethical concerns in Health Reform Ethical issues in advocacy and debate Case from Office of the Health Insurance Commissioner   | Angela<br>Sherwin |
|                           | Readings: Miller, TE. Sage, WM. "Disclosing physician financial incentives." JAMA. 281 (15):1424-1430. April 1999.  |                   |
|                           | Noone, GC, Ubel, PA. "Managed care organizations should not disclose their physicians' financial incentives." The American Journal of Managed Care. 3 (1): 159-160. January 1997.   |                   |
|                           | Armstrong, David. "How some doctors turn a \$90 profit from a \$17 test." The Wall Street Journal. September 30; CCXLVI (66): 1. 2005.  |                   |
|                           | Reiser, SJ. "The ethical life of health care organizations." Hastings Center Report. 28-35.   |                   |

|       | November-December, 1994.   |  |
|-------|--|--|
|       | S. R. Collins and K. Davis, Transparency in Health Care: The Time Has Come, The Commonwealth Fund, March 15, 2006  |  |
|       | Robinson J. Managed Consumerism in Health Care. <i>Health Affairs</i> . 1478-1489. Nov/Dec 2005.   |  |
|       | Sabin, JD and Cochran, D. Confronting Trad-Offs in Health Care: Harvard Pilgrim Health Care's Organizational Ethics Program. Health Affairs. 26(4): 1129-1134 (2007) |  |
|       | Case Study: Rhode Island Office of the Health Commissioner Reform Strategy   |  |
| 11/24 | Thanksgiving Holiday   |  |
| 12/1  | No Class   |  |
| 12/8  | Student Presentations  |  |